

112TH CONGRESS
2D SESSION

S. _____

To amend the Public Utility Regulatory Policies Act of 1978 to create a market-oriented standard for clean electric energy generation, and for other purposes.

IN THE SENATE OF THE UNITED STATES

Mr. BINGAMAN (for himself, _____) introduced the following bill; which was read twice and referred to the Committee on

A BILL

To amend the Public Utility Regulatory Policies Act of 1978 to create a market-oriented standard for clean electric energy generation, and for other purposes.

1 *Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representa-*
2 *tives of the United States of America in Congress assembled,*

3 **SECTION 1. SHORT TITLE.**

4 This Act may be cited as the “Clean Energy Stand-
5 ard Act of 2012”.

6 **SEC. 2. FEDERAL CLEAN ENERGY STANDARD.**

7 Title VI of the Public Utility Regulatory Policies Act
8 of 1978 (16 U.S.C. 2601 et seq.) is amended by adding
9 at the end the following:

1 “SEC. 610. FEDERAL CLEAN ENERGY STANDARD.

2 “(a) PURPOSE.—The purpose of this section is to cre-
3 ate a market-oriented standard for electric energy genera-
4 tion that stimulates clean energy innovation and promotes
5 a diverse set of low- and zero-carbon generation solutions
6 in the United States at the lowest incremental cost to elec-
7 tric consumers.

8 “(b) DEFINITIONS.—In this section:

9 “(1) CLEAN ENERGY.—The term ‘clean energy’
10 means electric energy that is generated—
11 “(A) at a facility placed in service after
12 December 31, 1991, using—
13 “(i) renewable energy;
14 “(ii) qualified renewable biomass;
15 “(iii) natural gas;
16 “(iv) hydropower;
17 “(v) nuclear power; or
18 “(vi) qualified waste-to-energy;
19 “(B) at a facility placed in service after
20 the date of enactment of this section, using—
21 “(i) qualified combined heat and
22 power; or
23 “(ii) a source of energy, other than
24 biomass, with lower annual carbon inten-
25 sity than 0.82 metric tons of carbon diox-
26 ide equivalent per megawatt-hour;

1 “(C) as a result of qualified efficiency im-
2 provements or capacity additions; or

3 “(D) at a facility that captures carbon di-
4 oxide and prevents the release of the carbon di-
5 oxide into the atmosphere.

6 “(2) NATURAL GAS.—

7 “(A) INCLUSION.—The term ‘natural gas’
8 includes coal mine methane.

9 “(B) EXCLUSIONS.—The term ‘natural
10 gas’ excludes landfill methane and biogas.

11 “(3) QUALIFIED COMBINED HEAT AND
12 POWER.—

13 “(A) IN GENERAL.—The term ‘qualified
14 combined heat and power’ means a system
15 that—

16 “(i) uses the same energy source for
17 the simultaneous or sequential generation
18 of electrical energy and thermal energy;

19 “(ii) produces at least—

20 “(I) 20 percent of the useful en-
21 ergy of the system in the form of elec-
22 tricity; and

23 “(II) 20 percent of the useful en-
24 ergy in the form of useful thermal en-
25 ergy;

1 “(iii) to the extent the system uses
2 biomass, uses only qualified renewable bio-
3 mass; and

4 “(iv) operates with an energy effi-
5 ciency percentage that is greater than 50
6 percent.

7 “(B) DETERMINATION OF ENERGY EFFI-
8 CIENCY.—For purposes of subparagraph (A),
9 the energy efficiency percentage of a combined
10 heat and power system shall be determined in
11 accordance with section 48(c)(3)(C)(i) of the
12 Internal Revenue Code of 1986.

13 “(4) QUALIFIED EFFICIENCY IMPROVEMENTS
14 OR CAPACITY ADDITIONS.—

15 “(A) IN GENERAL.—Subject to subpara-
16 graphs (B) and (C), the term ‘qualified effi-
17 ciency improvements or capacity additions’
18 means efficiency improvements or capacity ad-
19 ditions made after December 31, 1991, to—

20 “(i) a nuclear facility placed in service
21 on or before December 31, 1991; or

22 “(ii) a hydropower facility placed in
23 service on or before December 31, 1991.

24 “(B) EXCLUSION.—The term ‘qualified ef-
25 ficiency improvements or capacity additions’

1 does not include additional electric energy gen-
2 erated as a result of operational changes not di-
3 rectly associated with efficiency improvements
4 or capacity additions.

5 “(C) MEASUREMENT AND CERTIFI-
6 CATION.—In the case of hydropower, efficiency
7 improvements and capacity additions under this
8 paragraph shall be—

9 “(i) measured on the basis of the
10 same water flow information that is used
11 to determine the historic average annual
12 generation for the applicable hydroelectric
13 facility; and

14 “(ii) certified by the Secretary or the
15 Commission.

16 “(5) QUALIFIED RENEWABLE BIOMASS.—The
17 term ‘qualified renewable biomass’ means renewable
18 biomass produced and harvested through land man-
19 agement practices that maintain or restore the com-
20 position, structure, and processes of ecosystems, in-
21 cluding the diversity of plant and animal commu-
22 nities, water quality, and the productive capacity of
23 soil and the ecological systems.

1 “(6) QUALIFIED WASTE-TO-ENERGY.—The
2 term ‘qualified waste-to-energy’ means energy pro-
3 duced—

4 “(A) from the combustion of—

5 “(i) post-recycled municipal solid
6 waste;

7 “(ii) gas produced from the gasifi-
8 cation or pyrolyzation of post-recycled mu-
9 nicipal solid waste;

10 “(iii) biogas;

11 “(iv) landfill methane;

12 “(v) animal waste or animal byprod-
13 ucts; or

14 “(vi) wood, paper products that are
15 not commonly recyclable, and vegetation
16 (including trees and trimmings, yard
17 waste, pallets, railroad ties, crates, and
18 solid-wood manufacturing and construction
19 debris), if diverted from or separated from
20 other waste out of a municipal waste
21 stream; and

22 “(B) at a facility that the Commission has
23 certified, on an annual basis, is in compliance
24 with all applicable Federal and State environ-
25 mental permits, including—

1 “(i) in the case of a facility that com-
2 mences operation before the date of enact-
3 ment of this section, compliance with emis-
4 sion standards under sections 112 and 129
5 of the Clean Air Act (42 U.S.C. 7412,
6 7429) that apply as of the date of enact-
7 ment of this section to new facilities within
8 the applicable source category; and

9 “(ii) in the case of a facility that pro-
10 duces electric energy from the combustion,
11 pyrolyzation, or gasification of municipal
12 solid waste, certification that each local
13 government unit from which the waste
14 originates operates, participates in the op-
15 eration of, contracts for, or otherwise pro-
16 vides for recycling services for residents of
17 the local government unit.

18 “(7) RENEWABLE ENERGY.—The term ‘renew-
19 able energy’ means solar, wind, ocean, current, wave,
20 tidal, or geothermal energy.

21 “(c) CLEAN ENERGY REQUIREMENT.—

22 “(1) IN GENERAL.—Effective beginning in cal-
23 endar year 2015, each electric utility that sells elec-
24 tric energy to electric consumers in a State shall ob-
25 tain a percentage of the electric energy the electric

1 utility sells to electric consumers during a calendar
2 year from clean energy.

3 “(2) PERCENTAGE REQUIRED.—The percentage
4 of electric energy sold during a calendar year that
5 is required to be clean energy under paragraph (1)
6 shall be determined in accordance with the following
7 table:

“Calendar year	Minimum annual percentage
2015	24
2016	27
2017	30
2018	33
2019	36
2020	39
2021	42
2022	45
2023	48
2024	51
2025	54
2026	57
2027	60
2028	63
2029	66
2030	69
2031	72
2032	75
2033	78
2034	81
2035	84

8 “(3) DEDUCTION FOR ELECTRIC ENERGY GEN-
9 ERATED FROM HYDROPOWER OR NUCLEAR
10 POWER.—An electric utility that sells electric energy
11 to electric consumers from a facility placed in service
12 in the United States on or before December 31,
13 1991, using hydropower or nuclear power may de-

1 duct the quantity of the electric energy from the
2 quantity to which the percentage in paragraph (2)
3 applies.

4 “(d) MEANS OF COMPLIANCE.—An electric utility
5 shall meet the requirements of subsection (c) by—

6 “(1) submitting to the Secretary clean energy
7 credits issued under subsection (e);

8 “(2) making alternative compliance payments of
9 3 cents per kilowatt hour in accordance with sub-
10 section (i); or

11 “(3) taking a combination of actions described
12 in paragraphs (1) and (2).

13 “(e) FEDERAL CLEAN ENERGY TRADING PRO-
14 GRAM.—

15 “(1) ESTABLISHMENT.—Not later than 180
16 days after the date of enactment of this section, the
17 Secretary shall establish a Federal clean energy
18 credit trading program under which electric utilities
19 may submit to the Secretary clean energy credits to
20 certify compliance by the electric utilities with sub-
21 section (c).

22 “(2) CLEAN ENERGY CREDITS.—Except as pro-
23 vided in paragraph (3)(B), the Secretary shall issue
24 to each generator of electric energy a quantity of

1 clean energy credits determined in accordance with
2 subsections (f) and (g).

3 "(3) ADMINISTRATION.—In carrying out the
4 program under this subsection, the Secretary shall
5 ensure that—

6 "(A) a clean energy credit shall be used
7 only once for purposes of compliance with this
8 section; and

9 "(B) a clean energy credit issued for clean
10 energy generated and sold for resale under a
11 contract in effect on the date of enactment of
12 this section shall be issued to the purchasing
13 electric utility, unless otherwise provided by the
14 contract.

15 "(4) DELEGATION OF MARKET FUNCTION.—

16 "(A) IN GENERAL.—In carrying out the
17 program under this subsection, the Secretary
18 may delegate—

19 "(i) to 1 or more appropriate market-
20 making entities, the administration of a
21 national clean energy credit market for
22 purposes of establishing a transparent na-
23 tional market for the sale or trade of clean
24 energy credits; and

1 “(ii) to appropriate entities, the track-
2 ing of dispatch of clean generation.

3 “(B) ADMINISTRATION.—In making a del-
4 egation under subparagraph (A)(ii), the Sec-
5 retary shall ensure that the tracking and re-
6 porting of information concerning the dispatch
7 of clean generation is transparent, verifiable,
8 and independent of any generation or load in-
9 terests subject to an obligation under this sec-
10 tion.

11 “(5) BANKING OF CLEAN ENERGY CREDITS.—
12 Clean energy credits to be used for compliance pur-
13 poses under subsection (c) shall be valid for the year
14 in which the clean energy credits are issued or in
15 any subsequent calendar year.

16 “(f) DETERMINATION OF QUANTITY OF CREDIT.—

17 “(1) IN GENERAL.—Except as otherwise pro-
18 vided in this subsection, the quantity of clean energy
19 credits issued to each electric utility generating elec-
20 tric energy in the United States from clean energy
21 shall be equal to the product of—

22 “(A) for each generator owned by a utility,
23 the number of megawatt-hours of electric en-
24 ergy sold from that generator by the utility; and

25 “(B) the difference between—

1 “(i) 1.0; and
2 “(ii) the quotient obtained by divid-
3 ing—

4 “(I) the annual carbon intensity
5 of the generator, as determined in ac-
6 cordance with subsection (g), ex-
7 pressed in metric tons per megawatt-
8 hour; by

9 “(II) 0.82.

10 “(2) NEGATIVE CREDITS.—Notwithstanding
11 any other provision of this subsection, the Secretary
12 shall not issue a negative quantity of clean energy
13 credits to any generator.

14 “(3) QUALIFIED COMBINED HEAT AND
15 POWER.—

16 “(A) IN GENERAL.—The quantity of clean
17 energy credits issued to an owner of a qualified
18 combined heat and power system in the United
19 States shall be equal to the difference be-
20 tween—

21 “(i) the product obtained by multi-
22 plying—

23 “(I) the number of megawatt-
24 hours of electric energy generated by
25 the system; and

1 “(II) the difference between—
2 “(aa) 1.0; and
3 “(bb) the quotient obtained
4 by dividing—
5 “(AA) the annual car-
6 bon intensity of the gener-
7 ator, as determined in ac-
8 cordance with subsection
9 (g), expressed in metric tons
10 per megawatt-hour; by
11 “(BB) 0.82; and
12 “(ii) the product obtained by multi-
13 plying—
14 “(I) the number of megawatt-
15 hours of electric energy generated by
16 the system that are consumed onsite
17 by the facility; and
18 “(II) the annual target for elec-
19 tric energy sold during a calendar
20 year that is required to be clean en-
21 ergy under subsection (c)(2).
22 “(B) ADDITIONAL CREDITS.—In addition
23 to credits issued under subparagraph (A), the
24 Secretary shall award clean energy credits to an
25 owner of a qualified heat and power system in

1 the United States for greenhouse gas emissions
2 avoided as a result of the use of a qualified
3 combined heat and power system, rather than a
4 separate thermal source, to meet onsite thermal
5 needs.

6 “(4) QUALIFIED WASTE-TO-ENERGY.—The
7 quantity of clean energy credits issued to an electric
8 utility generating electric energy in the United
9 States from a qualified waste-to-energy facility shall
10 be equal to the product obtained by multiplying—

11 “(A) the number of megawatt-hours of
12 electric energy generated by the facility and
13 sold by the utility; and

14 “(B) 1.0.

15 “(g) DETERMINATION OF ANNUAL CARBON INTEN-
16 SITY OF GENERATING FACILITIES.—

17 “(1) IN GENERAL.—For purposes of deter-
18 mining the quantity of credits under subsection (f),
19 except as provided in paragraph (2), the Secretary
20 shall determine the annual carbon intensity of each
21 generator by dividing—

22 “(A) the net annual carbon dioxide equiva-
23 lent emissions of the generator; by

24 “(B) the annual quantity of electricity gen-
25 erated by the generator.

1 “(2) BIOMASS.—The Secretary shall—

2 “(A) not later than 180 days after the date
3 of enactment of this section, issue interim regu-
4 lations for determining the carbon intensity
5 based on an initial consideration of the issues
6 to be reported on under subparagraph (B);

7 “(B) not later than 180 days after the
8 date of enactment of this section, enter into an
9 agreement with the National Academy of
10 Sciences under which the Academy shall—

11 “(i) evaluate models and methodolo-
12 gies for quantifying net changes in green-
13 house gas emissions associated with gener-
14 ating electric energy from each significant
15 source of qualified renewable biomass, in-
16 cluding evaluation of additional sequestra-
17 tion or emissions associated with changes
18 in land use by the production of the bio-
19 mass; and

20 “(ii) not later than 1 year after the
21 date of enactment of this section, publish
22 a report that includes—

23 “(I) a description of the evalua-
24 tion required by clause (i); and

1 “(II) recommendations for deter-
2 mining the carbon intensity of electric
3 energy generated from qualified re-
4 newable biomass under this section;
5 and

6 “(C) not later than 180 days after the
7 publication of the report under subparagraph
8 (B)(ii), issue regulations for determining the
9 carbon intensity of electric energy generated
10 from qualified renewable biomass that take into
11 account the report.

12 “(3) CONSULTATION.—The Secretary shall con-
13 sult with—

14 “(A) the Administrator of the Environ-
15 mental Protection Agency in determining the
16 annual carbon intensity of generating facilities
17 under paragraph (1); and

18 “(B) the Administrator of the Environ-
19 mental Protection Agency, the Secretary of the
20 Interior, and the Secretary of Agriculture in
21 issuing regulations for determining the carbon
22 intensity of electric energy generated by bio-
23 mass under paragraph (2)(C).

24 “(h) CIVIL PENALTIES.—

1 “(1) IN GENERAL.—Subject to paragraph (2),
2 an electric utility that fails to meet the requirements
3 of this section shall be subject to a civil penalty in
4 an amount equal to the product obtained by multi-
5 plying—

6 “(A) the number of kilowatt-hours of elec-
7 tric energy sold by the utility to electric con-
8 sumers in violation of subsection (c); and

9 “(B) 200 percent of the value of the alter-
10 native compliance payment, as adjusted under
11 subsection (m).

12 “(2) WAIVERS AND MITIGATION.—

13 “(A) FORCE MAJEURE.—The Secretary
14 may mitigate or waive a civil penalty under this
15 subsection if the electric utility was unable to
16 comply with an applicable requirement of this
17 section for reasons outside of the reasonable
18 control of the utility.

19 “(B) REDUCTION FOR STATE PEN-
20 ALTIES.—The Secretary shall reduce the
21 amount of a penalty determined under para-
22 graph (1) by the amount paid by the electric
23 utility to a State for failure to comply with the
24 requirement of a State renewable energy pro-
25 gram, if the State requirement is more strin-

1 gent than the applicable requirement of this
2 section.

3 “(3) PROCEDURE FOR ASSESSING PENALTY.—
4 The Secretary shall assess a civil penalty under this
5 subsection in accordance with section 333(d) of the
6 Energy Policy and Conservation Act (42 U.S.C.
7 6303(d)).

8 “(i) ALTERNATIVE COMPLIANCE PAYMENTS.—An
9 electric utility may satisfy the requirements of subsection
10 (c), in whole or in part, by submitting in lieu of a clean
11 energy credit issued under this section a payment equal
12 to the amount required under subsection (d)(2), in accord-
13 ance with such regulations as the Secretary may promul-
14 gate.

15 “(j) STATE ENERGY EFFICIENCY FUNDING PRO-
16 GRAM.—

17 “(1) ESTABLISHMENT.—Not later than Decem-
18 ber 31, 2015, the Secretary shall establish a State
19 energy efficiency funding program.

20 “(2) FUNDING.—All funds collected by the Sec-
21 retary as alternative compliance payments under
22 subsection (i), or as civil penalties under subsection
23 (h), shall be used solely to carry out the program
24 under this subsection.

25 “(3) DISTRIBUTION TO STATES.—

1 “(A) IN GENERAL.—An amount equal to
2 75 percent of the funds described in paragraph
3 (2) shall be used by the Secretary, without fur-
4 ther appropriation or fiscal year limitation, to
5 provide funds to States for the implementation
6 of State energy efficiency plans under section
7 362 of the Energy Policy and Conservation Act
8 (42 U.S.C. 6322), in accordance with the pro-
9 portion of those amounts collected by the Sec-
10 retary from each State.

11 “(B) ACTION BY STATES.—A State that
12 receives funds under this paragraph shall main-
13 tain such records and evidence of compliance as
14 the Secretary may require.

15 “(4) GUIDELINES AND CRITERIA.—The Sec-
16 retary may issue such additional guidelines and cri-
17 teria for the program under this subsection as the
18 Secretary determines to be appropriate.

19 “(k) EXEMPTIONS.—

20 “(1) IN GENERAL.—This section shall not apply
21 during any calendar year to an electric utility that
22 sold less than the applicable quantity described in
23 paragraph (2) of megawatt-hours of electric energy
24 to electric consumers during the preceding calendar
25 year.

1 “(2) APPLICABLE QUANTITY.—For purposes of
2 paragraph (1), the applicable quantity is—
3 “(A) in the case of calendar year 2015,
4 2,000,000;
5 “(B) in the case of calendar year 2016,
6 1,900,000;
7 “(C) in the case of calendar year 2017,
8 1,800,000;
9 “(D) in the case of calendar year 2018,
10 1,700,000;
11 “(E) in the case of calendar year 2019,
12 1,600,000;
13 “(F) in the case of calendar year 2020,
14 1,500,000;
15 “(G) in the case of calendar year 2021,
16 1,400,000;
17 “(H) in the case of calendar year 2022,
18 1,300,000;
19 “(I) in the case of calendar year 2023,
20 1,200,000;
21 “(J) in the case of calendar year 2024,
22 1,100,000; and
23 “(K) in the case of calendar year 2025 and
24 each calendar year thereafter, 1,000,000.

1 “(3) CALCULATION OF ELECTRIC ENERGY

2 SOLD.—

3 “(A) DEFINITIONS.—In this subsection,
4 the terms ‘affiliate’ and ‘associate company’
5 have the meanings given the terms in section
6 1262 of the Energy Policy Act of 2005 (42
7 U.S.C. 16451).

8 “(B) INCLUSION.—For purposes of calcu-
9 lating the quantity of electric energy sold by an
10 electric utility under this subsection, the quan-
11 tity of electric energy sold by an affiliate of the
12 electric utility or an associate company shall be
13 treated as sold by the electric utility.

14 “(l) STATE PROGRAMS.—

15 “(1) SAVINGS PROVISION.—

16 “(A) IN GENERAL.—Subject to paragraph
17 (2), nothing in this section affects the authority
18 of a State or a political subdivision of a State
19 to adopt or enforce any law or regulation relat-
20 ing to—

21 “(i) clean or renewable energy; or

22 “(ii) the regulation of an electric util-
23 ity.

24 “(B) FEDERAL LAW.—No law or regula-
25 tion of a State or a political subdivision of a

1 State may relieve an electric utility from com-
2 pliance with an applicable requirement of this
3 section.

4 “(2) COORDINATION.—The Secretary, in con-
5 sultation with States that have clean and renewable
6 energy programs in effect, shall facilitate, to the
7 maximum extent practicable, coordination between
8 the Federal clean energy program under this section
9 and the relevant State clean and renewable energy
10 programs.

11 “(m) ADJUSTMENT OF ALTERNATIVE COMPLIANCE
12 PAYMENT.—Not later than December 31, 2016, and an-
13 nually thereafter, the Secretary shall—

14 “(1) increase by 5 percent the rate of the alter-
15 native compliance payment under subsection (d)(2);
16 and

17 “(2) additionally adjust that rate for inflation,
18 as the Secretary determines to be necessary.

19 “(n) REPORT ON CLEAN ENERGY RESOURCES THAT
20 DO NOT GENERATE ELECTRIC ENERGY.—

21 “(1) IN GENERAL.—Not later than 3 years
22 after the date of enactment of this section, the Sec-
23 retary shall submit to Congress a report examining
24 mechanisms to supplement the standard under this
25 section by addressing clean energy resources that do

1 not generate electric energy but that may substantially
2 reduce electric energy loads, including energy
3 efficiency, biomass converted to thermal energy, geo-
4 thermal energy collected using heat pumps, thermal
5 energy delivered through district heating systems,
6 and waste heat used as industrial process heat.

7 “(2) POTENTIAL INTEGRATION.—The report
8 under paragraph (1) shall examine the benefits and
9 challenges of integrating the additional clean energy
10 resources into the standard established by this sec-
11 tion, including—

12 “(A) the extent to which such an integra-
13 tion would achieve the purposes of this section;

14 “(B) the manner in which a baseline de-
15 scribing the use of the resources could be devel-
16 oped that would ensure that only incremental
17 action that increased the use of the resources
18 received credit; and

19 “(C) the challenges of pricing the re-
20 sources in a comparable manner between orga-
21 nized markets and vertically integrated mar-
22 kets, including options for the pricing.

23 “(3) COMPLEMENTARY POLICIES.—The report
24 under paragraph (1) shall examine the benefits and
25 challenges of using complementary policies or stand-

1 ards, other than the standard established under this
2 section, to provide effective incentives for using the
3 additional clean energy resources.

4 “(4) LEGISLATIVE RECOMMENDATIONS.—As
5 part of the report under paragraph (1), the Sec-
6 retary may provide legislative recommendations for
7 changes to the standard established under this sec-
8 tion or new complementary policies that would pro-
9 vide effective incentives for using the additional
10 clean energy resources.

11 “(o) EXCLUSIONS.—This section does not apply to an
12 electric utility located in the State of Alaska or Hawaii.

13 “(p) REGULATIONS.—Not later than 1 year after the
14 date of enactment of this section, the Secretary shall pro-
15 mulgate regulations to implement this section.

16 **“SEC. 611. REPORT ON NATURAL GAS CONSERVATION.**

17 “Not later than 2 years after the date of enactment
18 of this section, the Secretary shall submit to Congress a
19 report that—

20 “(1) quantifies the losses of natural gas during
21 the production and transportation of the natural
22 gas; and

23 “(2) makes recommendations, as appropriate,
24 for programs and policies to promote conservation of
25 natural gas for beneficial use.”.